

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDED AMENDMENTS TO LEP SCHEDULE AND/OR MAPPING

Background

All items have now been researched in accordance with the method proposed in the Stage 1 Report for the Review; and those recommended for change to their statutory status (including removal, amendment to Item descriptions in Schedule 5, amendments to mapping and/or combining of Items as groups) are listed in the following table.

Introduction to the Tables

The following section identifies the recommended changes to the LEP. It includes three tables:

1. Existing Items recommended for removal from the LEP
2. Recommendations for amendments to listed curtilage (including existing 'façade only' listings)
3. Administrative amendments to Item descriptions in Schedule 5 (residential properties)

Table 1 identifies the existing items that have been found to not satisfy the NSW Heritage Council's Criteria for heritage listing. They are recommended for removal from the LEP.

Table 2.

All existing 'façade only' LEP listings need to be amended. As discussed in detail in the Stage 1 Report of this Review, this limited type of listing does not protect the heritage value of the item, and indeed, particularly in areas undergoing rapid change, facilitates development so unsympathetic that the heritage values are lost even when the physical fabric of the façade is retained. The item Advance House at 127-137 Forest Road is recommended for removal from the LEP for this reason.

All other 'façade only' listings have retained the integrity of their setting (i.e. have not been subject to major redevelopment). Their LEP descriptions need to be amended to establish a framework that will lead to more sympathetic conservation outcomes should further development be proposed at the property. Including the whole of these properties in the listing will allow Council the opportunity to consider the impact of any proposal for major development in proper context against the item's actual heritage values and how these values can be 'read' through the physical and spatial qualities of the property as a whole. Note that the other details in Schedule 5 (property address and cadastral information) and the LEP Maps already identify the whole property as the curtilage of the item, and do not need to be altered.

Table 3.

Descriptions of Items in Schedule 5 of most LEPs provide only basic information about the fabric, such as "house". This has been alleged in DA submissions and Land and Environment Court cases to mean that the only significant element on the site is the fabric described, which is rarely the case. It is important that the LEP makes it clear that both built (house etc) and spatial/garden elements (the setting) are part of most items' heritage significance.

Department of Planning Practice Note PN 11-001 (p.13) advises that item descriptions in Schedule 5 should include a brief description of those things that are 'part of' the heritage significance of the item, and further detail is to be included in the Inventory forms (the SHI forms). In the case of the residential Heritage Items in the former Hurstville LGA (the study area), both the house and its setting (including boundaries, gardens, site layouts etc) are 'things' that form part of the heritage significance. Further details about these 'things' are included in the SHI forms. Table 3 provides revised descriptions for all residential heritage items. It also includes spelling and naming corrections where required. Note that these changes are administrative only and will not alter the listed boundary or level of significance of these items.

Other matters

1. It was found that some LEP listings and their accompanying SHI forms have contradictory information about the extent and inclusions of the Item. This was mostly noted in the case of complex sites with a mix of historic and contemporary buildings. The Review found that in each case the existing LEP Schedule and Mapped area reflects the heritage significance of the property, so the inconsistencies have been resolved through amendments to the SHI forms. None of these items are recommended for removal from the LEP and so are not included in the following table.
2. Note that the Cadastral details in the LEP schedule have not been reviewed since Council has the most up-to-date property data.
3. Note also that the brief for the Review did not provide for the identification of any new items. Some properties with the potential for heritage significance were identified during fieldwork and these will be advised to Council in the final report for further investigation.

1.0 ITEMS RECOMMENDED FOR REMOVAL FROM THE LEP

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS	RECOMMENDATION	COMMENT
PEAKHURST				
93	"Ilfracombe"	78 Bonds Road	Remove from LEP.	The existing SHI sheet identifies significance as the residence of Oliver Arnold Olds, an Alderman/Mayor of Hurstville Council, during his residence at the property in the 1920s. Fieldwork has revealed that the existing fabric is almost all new and includes substantial additions. Its footprint is also not consistent with the location of the original house visible on the 1943 aerial photographs. The property has retained a degree of traditional 'cottage' character but the loss of the integrity of its form and fabric, in particular that associated with Alderman Olds' occupation, mean that it does not satisfy the Criteria for local heritage significance.
HURSTVILLE TOWN CENTRE				
120	Advance House (facade only)	127–137 Forest Road	Remove from LEP.	Recent redevelopment has adversely impacted the heritage significance of the Item and has caused the loss of the physical, spatial and aesthetic context of the original building. The façade does not relate in a meaningful way to the building to which it is attached, and the property no longer satisfies the Criteria for Local Heritage Significance.
140	Shop	237 Forest Road	Remove from LEP.	This property was originally a pair to the adjoining item at 235 Forest Road (Hilliard's Butcher Shop, Item 139). The original building was either demolished and re-built or heavily altered to create the existing; which is a nondescript example of its type and does not satisfy the Criteria for Local Heritage Significance.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR AMENDMENTS TO LISTED CURTILAGE (INCLUDING EXISTING 'FAÇADE ONLY' LISTINGS AND AMALGAMATING OF GROUP ITEMS

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS ON LEP	RECOMMENDATION	COMMENT
HURSTVILLE				
24	Hurstville Oval and Velodrome	30D Dora Street	Curtilage (Schedule and Map) to include Lot 1 DP919317 (the oval) and Lot 53 DP 9355 (Dora Park).	The heritage values of this important local open space extend beyond the oval and some elements of its infrastructure (the current listing as described in the SHI form). The significance of this Item includes the whole of the area of the oval and adjacent informal open space of Dora Park which reads as part of the curtilage of the Oval. The listing should include all of the space bounded by Dora, Gordon, Patrick and Timothy Streets. Relative contributory values of the component elements and spaces are described in the SHI form.
LUGARNO				
60	Stone wharf, walls, path and setting	Between Bayside Drive and Lime Kiln Bay	Amend curtilage (Schedule and Map) to include: Lot 45; DP237063 Lot 26; DP232089 (both parts) Lot 1 DP793262 Riverbank	Landscape/archaeological site. Curtilage to be amended to include the path, walls, stone relics remnants of the jetty and the setting within the Reserve. Include also the waterfront area associated with The Hermitage that has the potential to contain additional evidence of historic water use of that property including any footings of jetty (now within river reserve) and evidence of historic paths/s.
64	Convict Road	Northern side, end of Forest Road	Extend curtilage to include Lots 8 and 9; DP29596 Lot 181; DP 752056	Map and schedule to reflect this curtilage. The existing listing includes Lot 8 only. The curtilage should be expanded to include the adjacent steep and timbered embankment which the road navigated originally. Amend Schedule 5 of LEP; including Item description, cadastral details and the LEP map. SHI to clarify location within the

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS ON LEP	RECOMMENDATION	COMMENT
65	Stone shed and ferry wharf slipway	Southern side, Forest Road	Lot 8; DP29596	curtilage and the historic and aesthetic importance of the steep bushland setting. This is the existing address on the LEP Schedule but the map shows a point location (dot) only. The LEP Map needs to identify Lot 8, which provides the aesthetic and historic context for the construction and operation of the ferry and its infrastructure. SHI to clarify location within the curtilage and the historic and aesthetic importance of the steep bushland setting.
MORTDALE				
71	Mortdale Railway Station and car sheds	Illawarra rail line	Amend the LEP description to exclude the sheds.	This Item is a Stage Government s170 listing. The station group is included in this listing but the sheds are not. The sheds are in the (former) Kogarah area, but not on its LEP. The current LEP map does not show the sheds. Retain the current listing; amend the name of the item.
73	Mortdale Uniting Church (Church only)	18 Morts Road	Amend description on the LEP to read "Mortdale Uniting Church and Grounds".	Listing to include the whole of the site (noting that the post-war building is non-contributory but forms part of the setting)
PEAKHURST				
97	"The Gardens on Forest"	765 Forest Road	Amend Item Description on LEP to read "The Gardens on Forest: Clovelly and grounds".	The significance is not limited to the façade of the original house. The whole of the site, including the lot, the house and the garden contribute to the heritage significance of this item. The buildings associated with the use as a function centre are also contributory for the evidence that it provides of its use for almost 100 years as a reception/function centre by the local community.

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS ON LEP	RECOMMENDATION	COMMENT
	HURSTVILLE TOWN CENTRE		Note relevant to the ‘façade’ listings below: The heritage significance of these buildings is not limited to their facades, but include the fabric and spatial qualities of the buildings as a whole, and, where relevant, rear yard areas. The integrity of oblique views over their parapets to sky and space behind are also important and need to be protected. The description of these Items needs to be amended. The address, cadastral information and maps already identify the whole sites and do not need to be altered.	
123	Front facade of building	160 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building’.	
130	Front facade of building	184 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building’.	Includes three significant streetscape elevations, two with rare surviving original detailing.
138	Rendered facade of building	232–242 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘group of shops’.	
143	Rendered facade of building	248 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building’.	
144	Front facade of building	255–257 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘group of shops’. AND Amalgamate with Item 145 as a Group Item extending from 255-257 Forest Road	NB: The shops at 255-273 Forest Road were designed as a row of 10 shops by noted local architect Charles Halstead and despite the infill of two of the shops with featureless facades, the row still reads as a group. It is recommended that Items 144 and 145 (i.e. 255-273 Forest Road) be included in the same listing to reflect their shared historic and aesthetic heritage values and to encourage them to be conserved as a group into the future. Refer to the SHI form for details.
145	Rendered facade of building	263–273 Forest Road	Amalgamate listing with Item 144 as a Group Item extending from 255-257 Forest Road	See item 144 above
146	Rendered facade of building	272 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building’.	
147	Shops	277–285 Forest Road	Retain on the LEP AND amalgamate with Item 148 as a Group Item extending from 277-291 Forest Road	277-291 form a cohesive group with consistent heritage values and good integrity as a symmetrical group of modest shops. The group should be listed

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS ON LEP	RECOMMENDATION	COMMENT
148	Ritchie House	289–291 Forest Road	Amalgamate listing with Item 147 as a Group Item extending from 277-291 Forest Road	as a single item. Refer to the amended SHI form for more detail. See Item 147 above.
149	Rendered facade of building	307 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building with two shopfronts’.	
152	Rendered facade of building	338–340 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘retail building’.	One of the most notable retail buildings in the town centre. It is critical to retain its spatial and aesthetic integrity and clarity of the façade in streetscape views.
153	Rendered facade of building	342–344 Forest Road	Amend description on the LEP to read ‘pair of retail buildings’.	

3.0 ADMINISTRATIVE AMENDMENTS TO ITEM DESCRIPTIONS IN SCHEDULE 5 (RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES)

The following table provides updated description of residential properties including spelling/item name corrections and to better reflect historical sources. Amended or added names are highlighted grey in the 'Item Name' column. These changes are administrative and do not alter the legal curtilage of the items, which is identified via the address, cadastral and mapped description of the lot on which the item is located.

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS	RECOMMENDED DESCRIPTION
BEVERLY HILLS			
2	Federation house	71 Edgbaston Road	Federation style weatherboard house, early outbuildings and spatial qualities of the setting
3	"Woodville"	79 Edgbaston Road	Late Federation house "Woodville" and setting
4	"Hilcrest"	130 Stoney Creek Road	Interwar house "Hilcrest" and setting, including front fence
5	Devonia Farm House	136 Stoney Creek Road	Timber Federation period house "Devonia Farm" and setting
CARLTON			
6	Weatherboard cottages and peppercorn tree	20 and 22 Botany Street	Weatherboard cottages and their setting including peppercorn tree
7	Old Ryan's Dairy	117 Botany Street	Stone cottage "Old Ryan's Dairy" and setting
8	House (Grenfell)	136 Carlton Parade	Interwar bungalow "Grenfell" (house and setting)
9	House	3 Cronulla Street	California bungalow (house and setting)
10	House	7 Cronulla Street	Interwar house and setting
11	"Semah" and "Waratah"	30-32 Cronulla Street	Pair of semi-detached cottages "Semah" and "Waratah" and their settings including front fences
12	House	43 Cronulla Street	California bungalow "Beverley" (house and setting including front fence)
13	"Glenreagh"	77 Cronulla Street	Federation house 'Glenreagh' (house and setting)
14	House (Clapham)	43 Durham Street	Late Federation house "Clapham" (house and setting including front fences and Canary Island Date Palm)
HURSTVILLE			
15	Victorian house	69 Bristol Road	Federation house and setting including front fence
16	Victorian house	76 Bristol Road	Rendered Victorian house and setting
17	Federation house	19 Carrington Avenue	Federation house and setting including trees to rear garden

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS	RECOMMENDED DESCRIPTION
18	Semi-detached Federation cottages	56-62 Carrington Avenue	Pair of semi-detached Federation cottages
19	Federation house	71 Carrington Avenue	Federation house and setting
20	Federation house	73 Carrington Avenue	Federation house and setting
21	Federation house (Canberra)	75 Carrington Avenue	Federation house "Canberra" and setting
22	Federation house	2 Clevedon Road	Federation house and setting
23	Federation house	4 Clevedon Road	Federation house "Dungog" and setting
25	"Busingny"	50 Dora Street	Federation house "Busigny" and setting including traditional garden setting
29	"Lilliesleaf"	50 Gloucester Road	Federation house "Lilliesleaf" and setting
31	Victorian house	14 Kimberley Road	Victorian house "Vermont" and setting
32	Federation house	18 Kimberley Road	Federation house and setting including front fence
33	Victorian house	62 Kimberley Road	Weatherboard cottage "Kimberley" and setting
34	"Lynne"	39 Lily Street	Weatherboard cottage "Lynne" and setting
35	Federation house	53 Lily Street	Late Federation bungalow and setting including front fence and traditional garden setting
36	Californian bungalow	76 Lily Street	Californian bungalow "Belbowrie" (house and setting), including front fence
37	"Erina"	18 Millett Street	Victorian Villa "Erina" (house and spaces of setting)
38	"Alinda"	29 Millett Street	Federation house "Alinda" and setting including fence and garden layout
39	Victorian cottage	67 Millett Street	Victorian house "Overdale" and setting
40	Federation house	16 Patrick Street	Federation house and setting
41	"Yarra-mundi"	75 Queens Road	Victorian house "Yarra-mundi" and remnant garden setting
42	"Gladwyn"	96 Queens Road	Victorian house "Gladwyn" and garden setting
44	Victorian terrace	24 Taunton Road	Free-standing terrace house and garden setting
45	Federation house	78 The Avenue	California bungalow "Claydon" and setting
46	Victorian house	79 The Avenue	Victorian House "Waimea" and front setback space
47	Victorian house	81 The Avenue	Victorian cottage "Erica" and front setback space
48	Victorian house	82 The Avenue	Victorian house "Roseleigh" and setting
49	Victorian house	84 The Avenue	Victorian house "Balgownie" and setting

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS	RECOMMENDED DESCRIPTION
50	"Yuringa"	85 The Avenue	Late Federation house "Yuriga" later "Allerton" and front garden
51	Federation house	87 The Avenue	Federation house "Oikos" and front garden
52	"Sylvan"	89 The Avenue	Interwar house "Sylvan" and garden setting
53	Federation house	90 The Avenue	Federation house "Oswaldene" and setting
54	Federation house	92 The Avenue	Federation house "Lorraine" and setting
55	"Waikouaiti"	95 The Avenue	Front portion of Victorian terrace "Waikouaiti"
56	Victorian semi-detached cottages	110-112 The Avenue	Pair of Victorian semi-detached houses and settings
57	Federation house	1 Vine Street	Transitional Federation/Interwar house and setting
58	Victorian house	26 Weston Road	Stone cottage "Senlack" and setting
KINGSGROVE			
59	House	287 Stoney Creek Road	Victorian Villa cottage and setting
LUGARNO			
61	"The Hermitage"	1 Bayside Drive	Stone house "The Hermitage" (remnant) and setting
66	"Killarney"	66A Moons Avenue	Cottage "Killarney" and setting
68	"Woodcliff"	12 Woodcliff Parade	Victorian house "Woodcliff" and setting
MORTDALE			
69	"Magrathea"	41 Boundary Road	Weatherboard cottage "Magrathea" and setting
72	Federation house	11 Jersey Avenue	Weatherboard bungalow and setting including front fence and garden
75	"Longleat"	7 Mutual Road	Brick house "Longleat" (excluding infill development to the rear)
OATLEY			
79	House	36 Lloyd Street	Interwar bungalow and setting including fence base
81	"Bangala"	7 Myall Street	Interwar bungalow "Bangala" and setting including brick fence and frangipanni
82	"Lindaville"	11 Waratah Street	Federation house "Lindaville" and setting
83	Federation house	30 Waratah Street	Federation house "Colwyn" and setting
84	Victorian house	34 Waratah Street	Rendered Victorian house "Merlewood" and setting

LEP ITEM NO	ITEM NAME	ADDRESS	RECOMMENDED DESCRIPTION
85	“Oxford”	8 Woronora Parade	Federation house “Oxford” and setting around original house
86	“Cambridge”	22 Woronora Parade	Federation house “Cambridge” and setting
87	Semi-detached Federation cottages	36-38 Woronora Parade	Pair of semi-detached Federation cottages and settings
88	Federation house	37 Woronora Parade	Federation house “Caprera” and setting
89	“Caprera”	46 Woronora Parade	Weatherboard Federation house ‘Aigburth’/”Carthona” and setting
90	Federation house	51 Woronora Parade	Federation house “Yengarie” and setting
91	“Yengarie”	84 Woronora Parade	Federation house “Truro” and setting
PEAKHURST			
95	“Rose Lea”	589 Forest Road	Interwar house “Rose Lea” (formerly “Lolama”) and setting
PENSHURST			
101	Federation house	17 Arcadia Street	Late Federation style house and setting
102	Federation house	19 Arcadia Street	Federation house “Hillside” and setting
103	Federation house	55 Cambridge Street	Late Federation style house “Alston” and setting
104	Federation house	60 Cambridge Street	Federation cottage and original setting
105	“Torino”	469 Forest Road	Victorian bungalow “Torino” and setting
107	“Ithiel”	55 Inverness Avenue	Victorian Villa “Ithiel” and setting
114	Bungalow	69 Penshurst Street	Federation bungalow and setting, front fence
115	“Ferncliff”	71 Penshurst Street	Federation house “Ferncliff” and setting
116	Semi-detached Federation cottages	102-108 Penshurst Street	Two pairs of semi-detached Federation cottages “Awaba” and “Waitia”; and “Werona” and “Yaralla” and settings
117	Federation house	146 Penshurst Street	Weatherboard Federation cottage and setting
HURSTVILLE TOWN CENTRE			
119	Semi-detached Victorian terraces	33–47 Dora Street	Four pairs of semi-detached Victorian cottages and settings
160	Federation house	12 The Avenue	Federation house and setting
161	Lorne	18 The Avenue	Victorian house “Lorne” and setting