

## Current Legal Cases – Status and Costs – June 2022

### Advice on Costs and Status of Council's Court Proceedings

#### Executive Summary

1. Advice on Council's Court proceedings for the period 1 June 2022 to 30 June 2022 is contained within this report.
2. Total legal costs to date for the 2021/22 financial year are \$1,841,162.00.
3. Total legal costs recovered to date for the 2021/22 financial year are \$543,780.00.
4. Total costs incurred by Council in legal proceedings are \$1,309,929.00.
5. Total nett costs are \$1,297,382.00.

#### Background

6. The current Court Proceedings for the reporting period are broken down as follows:

##### Land and Environment Court

- 21 x Class 1 (Merit/DA)
- 1 x Class 4 Proceedings
- 6 x Class 5 Proceedings

##### District Court

- 1 x matter

##### Local Court

- 1 x Council Prosecutions

##### Costs Recoveries

- 13 x costs recoveries

#### New Matters

7. There were 4 new matters in this reporting period: 4 x Class 1 Appeals: *Sharobem Holdings Pty Ltd, Winphil Pty Ltd, Smoljo and Lin & Qiu.*

## Finalised matters

8. Seven matters were finalised in this reporting period 6 x 1 Appeal matters: *McDonagh Developments Pty Ltd, Cao, Lateral Estate Pty Ltd (x2), Design Studio 407 Pty Ltd, Loucas Architects Pty Ltd* and costs matter: *Karavelas*

## Current Table

9. The Court proceedings current for the reporting period are set out below. The external costs include both external legal and expert consultants' (Court witnesses') fees.

No	Property Address / Applicant / Proceedings Number	Description of Matter	Status / Critical Dates
<b>Land and Environment Court Proceedings – Class 1 Appeals</b>			
1	870 & 870A Forest Road, Peakhurst  <b>Applicant:</b> McDonagh Developments Pty Ltd  <b>Proceedings:</b> 2021/295804	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0302 for a seniors living development comprising 6 x 3 bedroom and 2 x 2 bedroom "in-fill self care housing" dwellings including strata subdivision.	Matter listed for hearing on 15 June 2022. Section 34 Agreement entered into following amended plans.
2	176 – 178 Princes Highway, Beverley Park  <b>Applicant:</b> Loucas Architects Pty Limited  <b>Proceedings:</b> 2021/337124	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2020/0462 for the demolition of existing dwellings and construction of a six (6) storey residential building development containing twenty eight (28) units above two (2) levels of basement car parking and associated landscaping and communal open space.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 6 April 2022. S34 Agreement entered into following amended plans. S8.15 costs of \$18,000 paid.

3	<p>88 – 92 Botany Street, Carlton</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Hurstville Community Centre Incorporated</p> <p>Proceedings: 2021/360407</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2019/0644 for demolition works, alterations to existing building and change of use from nursing home to place of public workshop, community facilities and associated works.</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing on 17 – 19 August 2022.</p>
4	<p>47 Boronia Street, Kyle Bay</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Harry Myliotis</p> <p>Proceedings: 2022/16300</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of modification application MOD 2021/0142 for various modifications at basement level including increase in basement footprint along with relocation of external vents, inclusion of plant room, and inclusion of storage area. The modifications also include conversion of car space adjacent to lift into store and plant room; and lowering of pool coping level on 47 Boronia, removal of pool at 34 Cross Street, and relocation of alfresco and additional fill to north-western corner and demolition of fencing and new timber, fencing boundary.</p>	<p>Matter listed for S34AA Conference on 3 and 4 May 2022. Matter adjourned to 28 July 2022.</p>
5	<p>6 – 10 Torrens Street, Blakehurst</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Lioncrest Capital Holdings Pty Limited</p> <p>Proceedings: 2022/25659</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0478 which seeks consent for the demolition of existing dwellings and ancillary structures and construction of a five-storey residential flat</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing 20 and 21 September 2022.</p>

		building over basement parking.	
6	36 Chamberlain Street, Narwee  Parties: Commitment Pty Limited  Proceedings No: 2022/44228	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0415 for demolition works and construction of a child care centre.	Matter adjourned to 2 August 2022.
7	3 Coolangatta Road, Beverly Hills  <b>Applicant:</b> Chun Yue Cao  Proceedings 2022/337124	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2021/0021 for demolition, construction of a detached two storey dual occupancy development including landscaping and site works.	Matter listed for S34AA Conciliation on 21 and 22 June 2022. S34 Agreement entered into following amended plans.
8	26 Bowden Street, Connells Point  <b>Applicant:</b> Yasser Elgammal  Proceedings 2022/45831	Class 1 Appeal against Stop Work Order dated 11 February 2022.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 20 September 2022.
9	32 Montgomery Street, Kogarah  <b>Applicant:</b> Lateral Estate Pty Limited  Proceedings 2022/62002	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of modification application MOD2022/0014 to modify development consent DA2021/0110 for internal and external alterations to level 2 and alterations in relation to car parking.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 8 June 2022. S34 Agreement entered into following amended plans.
10	32 Montgomery Street, Kogarah  <b>Applicant:</b> Lateral Estate Pty Limited	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of modification application MOD2022/0013 to modify development consent DA2018/0139	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 8 June 2022. S34 Agreement entered into following amended plans.

	Proceedings 2022/62033	for internal and external alterations.	
11	12-14 Bembridge Street, Carlton  <b>Applicant:</b> Michel Murr  Proceedings 2022/65497	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0400 for demolition of existing structures and construction of five storey residential flat building comprising of 16 apartments with rooftop communal space and 2 levels of basement parking.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 27 May 2022. Matter was not resolved. Matter listed for hearing on 11 and 12 October 2022.
12	55 Park Road, Carlton  <b>Applicant:</b> Mamdouh Salem  Proceedings No: 2022/71021	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0295 for demolition of existing structures on the site, tree removal and the construction of a 6 storey mixed use development comprising a ground floor commercial tenancy, a 44 room boarding house including a communal room, managers room and associated amenities above two levels of basement car parking and associated landscaping and site works.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 2 June 2022. S34 Conference adjourned to 22 July 2022.
13	26 Martin Place, Mortdale  <b>Applicant:</b> JAMG Holdings Pty Ltd as Trustee for the JAMG Property Trust  Proceedings No: 2022/83335	Class 1 Appeal against demolition of existing structures, removal of trees, erection of a 4 storey residential flat building containing 5 units, parking on grade.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 26 July 2022.

14	49 Johnstone Street, Peakhurst  <b>Applicant:</b> Moussa Choker  Proceedings No. 2022/88489	Class 1 Appeal against demolition of existing buildings on the subject site and construction of a new dual occupancy development (each dwelling with a swimming pool and cabana). Removal / replacement of two trees.	Matter listed for hearing on 29 June 2022. Matter adjourned to 6 July 2022.
15	64 Moons Avenue, Lugarno  <b>Applicant:</b> Design Studio 407 Pty Limited  Proceedings No: 2022/92245	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of modification of consent of DA2018/0230 for alterations and additions to a dwelling house – removal of timber decks and Condition 10.	Matter listed for S34AA Conciliation Conference on 30 June 2022. S34 Agreement entered into following amended plans.
16	40 Oxford Street, Mortdale  <b>Applicant:</b> Pyramid Consulting Pty Limited  Proceedings No: 2022/96931	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2022/0041 for demolition of existing structures and construction of a part 3, part 4 storey, 27 room boarding house over two basement levels of carparking.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 29 July 2022.
17	30 – 32 The Avenue, Hurstville  <b>Applicant:</b> 32 The Avenue Hurstville Pty Ltd ATF 32 The Avenue Hurstville Trust  Proceedings No: 2022/122081	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0399 for demolition of existing structures, amalgamation of two existing lots and construction of a 4 storey mixed use residential flat building containing ground floor retail space, basement carparking and associated landscaping.	Matter listed for S34 Conference on 20 June 2022. Matter adjourned to 18 July 2022.

18	49 Jersey Avenue, Mortdale  <b>Applicant:</b> Sharobem Holdings Pty Limited  Proceedings No. 2022/164067	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2020/0354 for demolition works and the construction of a child care centre.	Matter listed for first directions on 5 July 2022.
19	49 Johnstone Street, Peakhurst  <b>Applicant:</b> Winphil Pty Limited  Proceedings No. 2022/174905	Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2021/0244 for demolition and construction of a mixed use development comprising basement car parking, ground floor commercial and residential apartments above (12 x studios used as affordable housing, 8 x 2 bedroom units and 5 x 3 bedroom units.	Matter listed for first directions hearing on 18 July 2022.
20	46A Llewellyn Street, Oatley  <b>Applicant:</b> Lovro Smoljo  Proceedings No. 2022/182295	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2021/0437 for demolition of existing double storey building and construction of a new two storey dwelling.	Matter listed for first directions hearing on 19 July 2022.
21	15 Dalcassia Street, Hurstville  <b>Applicant:</b> Wang Zhang Lin & Bao Zhen Qiu  Proceedings No. 2022/189574	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2020/0261 for demolition of existing structures and construction of a 12 room boarding house (one being a caretakers room), landscaping and site works.	Matter listed for first directions hearing on 27 July 2022.
<b>Class 4 Proceedings</b>			
1	244 Connells Point Road, Connells Point	Class 4 Application in relation to unauthorised excavation works	Notice of Motion relating to non-compliance with Court orders and contempt motion listed for 7 June

	<p><b>Parties:</b> Habib Hamade, Zeinab Hammoud, Carole Li and Winson Li</p> <p><b>Proceedings:</b> 2020/72897</p>	<p>resulting in the undermining of a retaining wall and swimming pool at neighbour's property.</p>	<p>2022. Matter listed for further hearing on 28 July 2022.</p>
<b>Class 5 Proceedings</b>			
1	<p>9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst</p> <p><b>Parties:</b> SAF Developments Pty Limited</p> <p>Proceedings: 2021/244132</p>	<p>Class 5 Summons for carrying out development on land which was prohibited.</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.</p>
2	<p>9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst</p> <p><b>Parties:</b> SAF Developments Pty Limited</p> <p>Proceedings: 2021/244133</p>	<p>Class 5 Summons for carrying out development not in accordance with consent.</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.</p>
3	<p>9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst</p> <p><b>Parties:</b> SAF Developments Pty Limited</p> <p>Proceedings: 2021/244134</p>	<p>Class 5 Summons for polluting land.</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.</p>
4	<p>9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst</p> <p><b>Parties:</b> SAF Developments Pty Limited</p> <p>Proceedings: 2021/244135</p>	<p>Class 5 Summons for unlawful transport of waste.</p>	<p>Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.</p>



5	9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst  <b>Parties:</b> Mohammad Safwan Abdul-Rahman  Proceedings: 2021/244136	Class 5 Summons for polluting land.	Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.
6	9 Nellella Street, Blakehurst  <b>Parties:</b> Mohammad Safwan Abdul-Rahman  Proceedings: 2021/244137	Class 5 Summons for unlawful transport of waste.	Matter listed for hearing 6 March to 17 March 2023.
<b>Local Court Proceedings</b>			
1	72A Ogilvy Street, Peakhurst  <b>Parties:</b> Faoud Haifa	Court Attendance Notice in relation to offence under <i>Companion Animals Act</i> 1988.	Matter listed for hearing on 1 November 2022.
<b>District Court</b>			
1	<b>Parties:</b> Stanley Xie	Appeal against Local Court decision of parking fine.	Matter listed for hearing on 11 April 2022. Matter adjourned to 2 September 2022.
<b>Costs</b>			
1	36 – 38 Waterview Street, Carlton  <b>Parties:</b> Tyre Nation Pty Ltd and Fardous & Saab Pty Limited  <b>Proceedings No:</b> 2020/170606	Statement of Charge for Contempt of Court filed following failure to comply with Court orders regarding fire safety.	Matter listed for hearing on 22 and 23 July 2021.  Consent orders entered into on 22 July 2021 with orders made for payment of \$220,000 by instalments.
2	977 Forest Road, Lugarno	Class 4 interlocutory proceedings seeking the Respondents be	Matter listed for hearing on 24 and 25 June 2021. Consent orders

	<p><b>Parties:</b> The Congregational Christian Church in Samoa, Parish of Sydney Inc</p> <p><b>Proceedings No:</b> 2020/304249</p>	<p>restrained from using the land for the purposes of a place of public worship unless in accordance with the conditions of Development Consent 2006/DA0372.</p>	<p>entered into to carry out acoustic measures at the site.</p> <p>Council awarded costs as agreed or as assessed.</p> <p>Respondent has failed to agree on an amount. Property to be sold.</p>
3	<p>Lot 9, 29 Laycock Road, Penshurst</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Penshurst Laycock Pty Ltd aff Trustee of Penshurst Laycock Unit</p> <p><b>Proceedings No.</b> 20/208037</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2020/0160 for construction of a two storey boarding house development containing 7 boarding rooms, excavation and construction of a basement containing two car parking spaces.</p>	<p>Matter listed for contested hearing on 29 to 31 March 2021. Appeal refused.</p> <p>Costs awarded as agreed or assessed on 30 June 2021.</p> <p>Applicant has failed to agree on an amount.</p> <p>Negotiations taking place with Applicant's solicitors.</p>
4	<p>Lot 10, 29 Laycock Road, Penshurst</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Penshurst Laycock Pty Ltd aff Trustee of Penshurst Laycock Unit</p> <p><b>Proceedings No.</b> 20/208038</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2020/0160 for construction of a two storey boarding house development containing 7 boarding rooms, excavation and construction of a basement containing two car parking spaces.</p>	<p>Matter listed for contested hearing on 29 to 31 March 2021. Appeal refused.</p> <p>Costs awarded as agreed or assessed on 30 June 2021.</p> <p>Applicant has failed to agree on an amount.</p> <p>Negotiations taking place with Applicant's solicitors.</p>
5	<p>Lot 11, 29 Laycock Road, Penshurst</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Penshurst Laycock Pty Ltd aff Trustee of Penshurst Laycock Unit</p>	<p>Class 1 Appeal against deemed refusal of DA2020/0160 for construction of a two storey boarding house development containing 7 boarding rooms, excavation and construction of a basement containing two car parking spaces.</p>	<p>Matter listed for contested hearing on 29 to 31 March 2021. Appeal refused.</p> <p>Costs awarded as agreed or assessed on 30 June 2021.</p> <p>Applicant has failed to agree on an amount.</p> <p>Negotiations taking place with Applicant's solicitors.</p>

	<b>Proceedings No.</b> 20/208036		
6	54 Lawrence Street, Peakhurst  <b>Applicant:</b> William Karavelas  <b>Proceedings No:</b> 20/222456	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2018/0578 for demolition of existing dwelling and ancillary structures and construction of a residential flat building containing 6 apartments over basement parking.	Matter listed for contested hearing on 17 and 18 May 2021. Section 34 Agreement entered into following amended plans. S8.15 costs to be paid in the amount of \$8,000. Payment now made. Matter complete.
7	2 – 4 Vaughan Street, Blakehurst  <b>Applicant:</b> Gianni Georges  <b>Proceedings No:</b> 2019/282526	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2018/0517 for demolition of existing dwellings and improvements and the erection of a strata residential flat building development comprising 24 units being 4 x 1 bed, 18 x 2 bed and 2 x 3 bed apartments above basement parking for 38 cars.	Matter listed for contested hearing 9 to 11 December 2020. Judgment handed down on 18 January 2021. Appeal dismissed.  Costs awarded as agreed or assessed on 18 January 2021.  Applicant has failed to agree on an amount.  Costs assessment filed with Supreme Court.
8	5 Maclaurin Street, Penshurst  <b>Parties:</b> Emanuel Mifsud  <b>Proceedings No:</b> 2019/323436	Proceedings commenced requiring Respondent to remove articles and items from the Premises (hoarding).	Listed for a contested hearing on 28 and 29 July 2020. Judgment issued on 30 October 2020. Orders made for Respondent to remove articles and items within 28 days, failing which Council can carry out the works. Contractors arranged to carry out the works on 1 December 2020.  Council awarded costs as agreed or as assessed.  Respondent has failed to agree on an amount.  Bill of costs prepared. Mediation with Defendant failed to resolve the

			matter. Awaiting determination by costs assessor.
9	297 Rocky Point Road, Sans Souci  <b>Parties:</b> Alan Frederick Goddard  <b>Proceedings No:</b> 2018/366019	Proceedings commenced for accumulation of items resulting in premises being in an unsafe or unhealthy condition under the <i>Local Government Act, 1993</i> .	On 24 September 2019 the Court held that the premises were unsafe or unhealthy and made Orders for de-accumulation of items in accordance with a schedule provided by Council. Costs awarded in favour of Council.  Council awarded costs as agreed or as assessed.  Bill of costs prepared. Awaiting determination by costs assessor.
10	977 Forest Road, Lugarno  <b>Parties:</b> The Congregational Christian Church in Samoa, Parish of Sydney Incorporated and Taeipo Malifa  <b>Proceedings No.</b> 2018/23816 2019/43432	Proceedings commenced against Respondents for a declaration that the First and Second Respondents have each breached the <i>Protection of the Environment (Operations) Act 1997</i> by failing to comply with prevention notices given to each of them under section 96 of that Act by Council.	Costs awarded following hearing on 12 and 13 December 2018 and on 31 May 2019. Costs assessment finalised and Certificates of Judgment registered.  Bankruptcy proceedings now commenced against Taeipo Malifa. A Creditor's Petition is being prepared to be filed with the Court.  A Writ of Execution has been recorded on the Certificate of Title for the property owned by the Church. Property is now to be sold.
11	244 Connells Point Road, Connells Point  <b>Parties:</b> Habib Hamade, Zeinab Hammoud, Carole Li and Winson Li  <b>Proceedings:</b> 2020/72897	Class 4 Application in relation to unauthorised excavation works resulting in the undermining of a retaining wall and swimming pool at neighbour's property.	Consent Orders issued on 19 October 2020 including orders that the First and Second Respondents pay Council's costs as agreed or as assessed.  Costs assessment review application filed with Supreme Court. Awaiting judgment.
12	34 Milsop & 47 Jersey Avenue, Mortdale	Proceedings commenced for unauthorised erection of structures and slabs, including habitation of	Respondent found to be in Contempt of Court Orders on 30 September 2019.

	<p><b>Parties:</b> Robert Stojanovski &amp; Steven Stojanovski</p> <p><b>Proceedings No:</b> 2018/99739</p>	structure at the premises.	<p>Costs assessment process undertaken.</p> <p>Bankruptcy proceedings commenced. Hearing of Creditor's Petition to take place on or about 11 November 2021. Awaiting further information from the Official Trustee in Bankruptcy.</p>
13	<p>4 The Esplanade, South Hurstville</p> <p><b>Applicant:</b> Ekon Pty Limited</p> <p><b>Proceedings No:</b> 2019/296629</p>	Class 1 Appeal against refusal of DA2017/0659 for demolition of existing structures and construction of 68 place childcare centre at 4 The Esplanade, South Hurstville.	<p>Matter listed for contested hearing on 24 and 25 May 2021. Appeal refused.</p> <p>Negotiations in relation to costs taking place with Applicant's solicitors.</p>

10. Costs to date are as follows:

Type	Amount
Class 1 Appeals – Consultants for Court Proceedings	\$483,772
Class 1 Appeals – Planning DA External Lawyers	\$548,493
Class 2 Appeals	\$0
Class 3 Appeals	\$0
Class 4 Appeals	\$185,922
Class 5 Appeals	\$53,389
Local Court Prosecutions/Enforcements	\$22,990
Supreme Court Proceedings	\$0
Industrial Relations Commission (IRC)	\$0
NSW Civil and Administrative Tribunal (NCAT)	\$15,363
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,309,929</b>